Minutes of a meeting of the Healthy, Safe, Clean and Green Communities Scrutiny Committee held in the Council Chamber, the Arc, High Street, Clowne on Friday 2<sup>nd</sup> November 2018 at 1000 hours.

### PRESENT:-

Members:-

Councillor S. Peake in the Chair

Councillors J.A. Clifton, Mrs P. Cooper, C.R. Moesby, T. Munro, P. Smith and K.F. Walker.

Officers J. Wilson (Scrutiny & Elections Officer), K. Drury (Information Engagement & Performance Manager)(to Minute No 0418) and A. Bluff (Governance Officer).

Also in attendance at the meeting was Councillor B.R. Murray-Carr (Portfolio Holder for Streetscene) and L. Robinson (Finance Assistant) observing.

#### 0412. APOLOGIES

Apologies for absence were received on behalf of Councillors J.E. Bennett and T. Cannon.

### 0413. URGENT ITEMS OF BUSINESS

There were no urgent items of business to consider.

## 0414. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Minute Number Councillor Declaration

0417 (HO9) C.R. Moesby Non Significant, Non Statutory

# 0415. MINUTES – 5<sup>TH</sup> OCTOBER 2018

Moved by Councillor J. Clifton and seconded by Councillor K. Walker **RESOLVED** that the Minutes of a Healthy, Safe, Clean and Green Communities Scrutiny Committee held on 5<sup>th</sup> October 2018 be approved as a correct record.

# 0416. LIST OF KEY DECISIONS AND ITEMS TO BE CONSIDERED IN PRIVATE

Committee considered the List of Key Decisions and items to be considered in private document.

A Member suggested that a 'document direction' was needed to aid Members in relation to items which appeared on the List of Key Decisions as the List itself did not provide enough information to Members.

The Scrutiny & Elections Officer noted that the reports referred to in the List of Key Decisions and Items to be considered in private document were now available to all Members on their portals.

Moved by Councillor C.R Moesby and seconded by Councillor S. Peake **RESOLVED** that the List of Key Decisions and Items to be considered in Private document be noted.

# 0417. CORPORATE PLAN TARGETS PERFORMANCE UPDATE – JULY TO SEPTEMBER 2019 (QUARTER 2 - 2018/19)

Committee considered a report which provided performance outturns for the period July 2018 to September 2018 in relation to Corporate Plan Targets under the Committee's remit of 'supporting our communities to be healthier, safer, cleaner and greener'.

17 targets sat under the Committee's remit. 8 targets were on track, 6 targets had been previously achieved and 1 target withdrawn. 1 target was flagged as an 'alert' as it was unlikely that it would achieve its intended outcome by March 2019.

With regard to targets H04 and H09, queries had been raised at the Scrutiny pre meeting by the Chair and Vice Chair and a response was circulated to the meeting as follows:

# H 04 - Tackle childhood obesity through the delivery of a child focused health intervention programme to all Key Stage 2 year groups by the end of each academic year.

Are we able to find another source of funding to continue this work, even if it ran under another name? Members appreciate the achievement of the team in delivering this work.

# Officer Response;

Leisure have secured funding for a school based physical activity programme, but this is not specific to tackling childhood obesity. The funding is from each school and comes from ring fenced monies from their PE & Sport Premium grants.

The funding previously came from Public Health and was to deliver the specific programme, but unfortunately this was cut as part of their funding review.

Under the new programme the schools will advise what their requirements are. Leisure has developed a menu of exercises as part of their proposal. The focus is still on key stage 2 year groups.

A Member felt that tackling obesity in children should start before Key Stage 2 as children could show signs of obesity at Key Stage 1. He also queried what guidance Leisure Services would be providing to the schools and asked this to be investigated. The Information Engagement & Performance Manager advised the meeting that she would raise the Member's query with Leisure staff and report back to Committee.

# H 09 - Achieve a combined recycling and composting rate of 49% by March 2019.

Members are not aware of any publicity over the use of the approved paper/corn starch bags for food waste recycling – is any planned?

Is it possible to extend the green bin collection for a longer period, to further extend food recycling?

How do you intend to realign the target for the new Plan? Members also query if this target was set too high in the first instance?

Where is the local MRF which receives BDC waste?

Are we currently being subject to any financial penalties for contamination in the red/green bins?

In relation to the attempt at trend comparison in the commentary, Members find the narrative confusing. The officer mentions comparison with of Q2 17/18 but no figure is given (in addition to no estimated figure for Q2 18/19). It is clear the Q1 18/19 actual was received after the original comment was submitted, but to keep the original reference to the estimate for Q1 as well makes the narrative confusing. They suggest it may have been better to compare Q1 17/17 and Q1 18/19 to look at the trend as there is 'actual' data for both of these.

# Officer Response;

Derbyshire County Council (DCC) have given the Council the green light in allowing use of 'corn-starch' type bags in food waste (green bin) collections further to undertaking trials in the High Peak area. However, given their In-Vessel-Composing (IVC) operator concerns, they did not want a massive stepped introduction; rather, a graduated one! (They need to get the process right on site for producing the right quality of compost). Therefore, they asked that we do not undertake a direct promotion of this; instead, to do it subtly by way of advising customers who contact our Call Centres enquiring about food-waste caddy liners (Call Centre Scripts changed) and by way of our Community Recycling Promoters when undertaking educational (door-stepping) visits to resident households. We have also removed the reference from this year's calendars to being only able to use paper bag\liner meeting EN13432. Calendars

now advise the use of compostable bags meeting EN13432, as set out below and will undertake more direct promotion when DCC give us a green light.



The Council is currently involved in a Derbyshire wide piece of work looking at how to increase organic (food\garden) waste diversion from residual (black bin) to organic (green bin) waste stream; in particular, if the UK adopts the EU Circular Economy to make separate food waste collections mandatory by 2023, we will have to consider either separate collection arrangements (i.e. increased staff\vehicles) or continue comingling garden and food-waste in green bins collected 12 months per year. However, at this time 92% of organic waste is collected between March\November each year and it is not an effective use of resources to collect the remaining 8% by way of expending 25% of waste collection resource.

The targets were set in line with the Revised Waste Framework Directive (rWFD) and we relied on the Arkwright In-Vessel-Composting (IVC) driving food waste diversion when it opened. However, delays in its opening (Planning Appeal) and inability to use corn-starch bags, stifled anticipated organic\food-waste diversion and targets being met. The Circular Economy (if adopted by the UK) will require 65% municipal waste recycling by 2030 and the Derbyshire wide piece of work being undertake will consider how this may be achieved. It is anticipated proposals will be developed from mid-2019 and inform the new Corporate Plan.

The local MRF is at Alfreton (HG Martins facility at Coates Park).

The new burgundy bin contract was reviewed at time of tender to address contamination costs under the former contract and we have arrangements in place (education\recycling promoters) to manage this. With regard to green bins, we have very clean\good quality inputs to the Arkwright IVC and this is achieved by our in-house collection staff who assist in monitoring contamination at the kerbside.

### Performance data

Due to the time lags in receiving qualified figures, an estimate is provided each quarter based on the actual figure for the same period the previous financial year. In addition the actual figure for the previous quarter is also provided at the bottom of the commentary to ensure that Members receive this information.

Taking on board the comments made, we could simplify the presentation of this data as follows:

Q2 – 46.2% Estimate based on Q2 2017/18 Actual outturn.

# Trend data – Q1 Actuals

2018/19 47.7% 4668 tonnes 2017/18 46.9% 4335 tonnes

A Member raised concerns with regard to the information relating to the Circular Economy, (if adopted by the UK), which would require 65% municipal waste recycling by 2030 and suggested that milestones should be set against the target so Members could see what would happen to achieve the target.

A Member queried if there was anything written into the Council's tenancy agreements on how waste is sorted out into bins. The Chair suggested that this be raised with the Head of Housing.

The Portfolio Holder for Streetscene advised the meeting that this year, the Green Bin waste collection service had been extended from November until 4<sup>th</sup> December 2018 and this had been advertised in the Council's In Touch newspaper which was delivered to every household in the District.

A Member noted that biodegradable bin liners did not seem to appear in supermarkets and were not readily accessible.

A discussion took place regarding the availability of corn starch bags to residents. It was confirmed that these were readily available in local supermarkets including Wilkos. A Member felt that a corporate response was needed from the retail industry and the Council could negotiate with the large suppliers regarding corn starch bags.

# H 10 - Sustain standards of litter cleanliness to ensure 96% of streets each year meet an acceptable level as assessed by Local Environment Quality Surveys (LEQS).

A Member queried what evidence was available regarding the 97% of streets meeting the target standard as alluded to in the report. The Scrutiny & Elections Officer agreed to follow this information up and report back to Committee.

# H 11 - Sustain standards of dog fouling cleanliness to ensure 98% of streets each year meet an acceptable level as assessed by Local Environment Quality Surveys (LEQS).

Members queried if the same areas/streets were being analysed each quarter for the Performance Indicator. The Scrutiny & Elections Officer agreed to follow up this information and advise Members at the next meeting.

# H 12 - Annually undertake 10 local environmental enforcement and educational initiatives in targeted areas to deal with dog fouling, littering or fly tipping.

A Member queried if any of the fixed penalty notices referred to in the report had been paid. The Scrutiny & Elections Officer agreed to follow up this information and advise Members at the next meeting.

A Member also queried how the Corporate Plan Targets had been set in general. Through other work they were aware of the use of trend data to monitor performance and queried if this approach was being used by BDC; particularly where performance was nearing the maximum level and it was proving difficult to stretch the target further. They suggested this could be a useful approach when considering Targets for the new Corporate Plan. The Scrutiny & Elections Officer agreed to raise the issue with relevant officers.

Moved by Councillor S. Peake and seconded by Councillor C.R. Moesby **RESOLVED** that the report be noted.

The Information Engagement & Performance Manager left the meeting.

### 0418. SCRUTINY COMMITTEE WORK PROGRAMME 2018/19

Committee considered their Work Programme 2018/19.

Members were reminded that due to the Purdah period in 2019, the scheduled meeting date of the Committee would be changed from Friday 29<sup>th</sup> March 2019 to Friday 22<sup>nd</sup> March 2019. A formal letter would be sent to Members regarding this.

The meeting concluded at 1100 hours.